BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10084624 5

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

VOLUME 1

September 1983

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 14 1983

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

VOLUME 1

September 1983

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/employmentlaw01lang

EMPLOYMENT LAW

Table of Contents

		PAGE
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
	A. Fuller & Perdue, "The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages."	1
	B. A.A. Leff, "Economic Analysis of Law: Some Realism About Nominalism."	1
	C. Thomas Nagel, Review of R. Nozick, Anarchy, State, and Utopia.	3
	D. Duncan Kennedy, "The Structure of Blackstone's Commentaries."	4
	E. Robert W. Gordon, "New Developments in Legal Theory."	6
II.	WORK, EMPLOYMENT, AND THE "PROPER" LEGAL ANALYSIS	11
	A. Introduction	11
	1. Studs Terkel, Working.	11
	2. Seabrook, Unemployment.	22
	3. Harry Braverman, Labour and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century.	23
	4. David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity."	32
	5. Adina Schwartz, "Meaningful Work."	39
	6. Wood and Kumar, The Current Industrial Relations Scene in Canada	46
	B. The Contract/Status Debate	58
	1. Sir Henry Maine, Ancient Law.	58
	2. Karl Polanyi, The Great Transformation.	60
	3. Milton Friedman, Capitalism & Freedom.	61
	4. Richard Posner, The Economics of Justice.	67
	5. Elizabeth Mensch, "The History of Mainstream Legal Thought."	69
	6. John Rawls, A Theory of Justice.	71
	7. Scanlon, "Liberty, Contract and Contribution."	72
	8. David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity."	73

9. Tuohy and Trebilcock, Policy Options in the Regulation of Asbestos-Related Health Hazards. 82

10. Barry J. Reiter, "The Control of Contract Power." 87

C. Questions 91

D. Contractual Analysis 92

1. Innis Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 92

2. Arthurs, Carter and Glasbeek, Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada. 92

3. Freedland, The Contract of Employment. 92

4. Ian McNeil, "The Many Futures of Contract." 96

5. Fox, Beyond Contract: Work, Power and Trust Relations. 104

III. THE SEARCH FOR THE "ESSENCE" OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP AND THE ANSWER TO THE QUESTION "IS THIS PERSON AN EMPLOYEE? 107

A. General 107

1. Introduction. 107

2. Questions. 107

3. Short v. Henderson. 107

a) Kahn-Freund, Note. 108

b) Davis and Freedland, Labour Law: Text and Materials. 108

4. Ready Mixed Concrete v. Min. of Pensions and National Insurance. 109

5. Re Becker Milk Co. 112

6. Re Becker Milk Co. (Div. Ct.). 121

7. Onyshuk v. Duncan Bros. Ltd. 126

8. Salvation Army Sheltered Workshop and Kaszuba 128

B. The Importance of Avoiding Formalism 172

1. NLRB v. Hearst Publications. 172

2. Ontario Labour Relations Act. 179

3. Denham v. Midland Employers' Mutual Assurance Ltd. 179

4. I.L.A. v. M.E.A. 183

5. Ludwig Wittgenstein, Philosophical Investigations. 185

C. Notes and Questions 188

1. Re D.J.'s Family Centre Ltd. 188

2. Problem. 188

IV. HIRING 190

A. Introduction 190

Freedland, The Contract of Employment. 190

B. Discrimination in Hiring 195

1. Richard Posner, The Economics of Justice. 195

2. Ronald Dworkin, Taking Rights Seriously. 199

3. Fallon, "To Each According to His Ability, From None According to His Race: The Concept of Merit in Anti-Discrimination Law." 204

4. The Common Law. 209

Bd. of Governors of Seneca College v. Bhadauria. 209

5. Statutes. 218

a) Griggs v. Duke Power Co. 219

b) Note. 223

c) OHRC v. Simpson-Sears Ltd. (Div. Ct.). 227

d) OHRC v. Simpson-Sears Ltd. (C.A.). 241

e) Morley Rand v. Sealy Eastern Limited. 243

f) Statistical Evidence. 262

i) Sullivan, Zimmer and Richard, Federal Statutory Law of Employment Discrimination. 262

ii) Re Windsor Bd. of Education. 265

iii) Dothard v. Rawlinson. 279

6. The Constitution 290

Corwin, The Constitution and What it Means Today. 290

7. Affirmative Action 292

a) Some Theoretical Considerations 292

i) George Sher, "Justifying Reverse Discrimination in Employment." 292

ii) Richard Wasserstrom, "Preferential Treatment." 303

b) Affirmative Action in the Courts 334

i) Athabasca Tribal Council v. Amoco (Alta. C.A.). 334

ii) Re Athabasca Tribal Council and Amoco (S.C.C.). 353

V. THE CONTENT OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP (EMPLOYER AND EMPLOYEE RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS) 358

Introduction 359

Fox, Beyond Contract: Work, Power, and Trust Relationships. 359

A. Express Obligations and Their Variation 360

1. Peerless Laundry v. Neal. 360

2. Hill v. Peter Gorman. 363

3. K.M.A. Catering v. Howie. 375

4. Campbell v. MacMillan Bloedel. 378

B. Restrictive Covenants 379

1. Nordenfelt v. Maxim Nordenfelt. 379

2. M.S. Drapers v. Reynolds. 379

3. Innis Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 381

4. Kores Manufacturing v. Kolok Manufacturing. 384

C. An Aside About Pensions and Their Regulation 390

1. Types of Pensions 390

Joel Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer for Lawyers." 390

2. Legislative Initiatives 393

a) Regulation of Private Plans 393

i) Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 393

ii) Ontario Pensions Benefits Act. 395

iii) Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer for Lawyers." 396

b) The Canada Pension Plan and Old Age Security Pension 397

i) Arthur, Carter and Glasbeek, Labour Law 397

ii) Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer For Lawyers." 399

3. Pensions and Discrimination 400

a) City of Los Angelos v. Manhart. 400

b) Richard Schweiker, "Insurance by Gender." 407

c) Arizona Governing Committee v. Norris. 408

D. A Note About Implied Obligations in General 418

1. Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 418

E. Competence 425

1. Cassidy v. Ministry of Health. 425

2. Lister v. Romford Ice & Cold Storage. 431
3. Sealand of the Pacific. 436
4. D.H. Overmyer v. Wallace Transfer. 437
5. Janata Bank v. Ahmed. 440
6. Barry J. Reiter, "Contracts, Torts, Relations and Reliance." 445

F. Fidelity, Inventions, Competition, Trade Secrets, Confidental Information, Fiduciary Obligations and Bribes. 453
1. Robb v. Green. 453
2. State Vacuum Stores v. Phillips. 454
3. Triplex Safety Glass v. Scorah. 460
4. W.J. Gage v. Sugden. 461
5. Spiroll Corp. v. Putti. 466
6. Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 467
7. James O'Connor, The Fiscal Crisis of the State. 471
8. Reading v. Attorney-General. 473
9. Canadian Aero Service v. O'Malley. 474

VI TERMINATION 491

A. Introduction 492
1. David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity." 492
2. Katherine Swinton, "Contract Law and the Employment Relationship: The Proper Forum for Reform." 495

B. Expiration of a Fixed Term and Agreed Periods of Notice 499
1. The Employment Standards Act. 499
2. Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 499
3. Re Christopher and CKXM-FM. 505
4. Nardocchio v. CIBC. 511

C. Retirement 527
1. Employment Standards Act Regulations. 527
2. Bell Canada v. OPEIU. 527

D. Firing. 537

1. Termination With Due Notice or Pay in Lieu 537

a) The Common Law 537

i) Carter v. Bell & Sons. 537

ii) Bardal v. The Globe & Mail. 539

iii) Bohemier v. Storwal International. 545

iv) Suttie v. Metro Transit. 550

v) Harris, Wrongful Dismissal. 554

vi) McDonald v. Swift Canadian Co. Ltd. 557

VOLUME 2

b) Remedies for Wrongful Dismissal 558

i) Quantum and Heads of Damage 558

(a) Addis v. Gramaphone Ltd. 558

(b) McMinn v. Town of Oakville. 570

(c) Pilon v. Peugot. 577

(d) Bohemier v. Storwal International. 581

(e) Dobson v. T. Eaton Co. 586

(f) Centennial Centre v. VS Services. 590

ii) The Duty to Mitigate. 592

Red Deer College v. Michaels. 592

iii) Specific Performance 596

(a) De Francesco v. Barnum. 596

(b) Hill v. C.A. Parsons. 601

(c) Warner Bros. v. Nelson. 613

c) Statutory Regulation 621

i) The Employment Standards Act. 621

ii) Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 624

iii) Freightliner of Canada Ltd. v. Canadian Association of Industrial, Mechanical and Allied Workers, Local 14 and Employment Standards Board. 628

2. Summary Dismissal: Dismissal With Cause 632

a) Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 632

b) Laws v. London Chronicle. 642

c) Markey v. Port Weller Dry Docks. 645

5. Quitting, Constructive Dismissal (Quitting for Cause) and Variation 657
a) Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 657
b) Thomas Marshall Exports v. Guinle. 660
c) Note: Gunton v. Richmond-on-Thames. 668
d) Gould v. Hermes Electronics. 672
e) Baker v. Burns Foods. 684
f) Wallace v. Toronto-Dominion Bank. 686
g) Longman v. FBDB. 702
h) Peerless Laundry v. Neal 715
i) Hill v. Peter Gorman 715
4. A Pause for Reflection 716
a) David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity." 717
b) David Cohen, "The Relationship of Contractual Remedies to Political and Social Status." 733
5. Natural Justice and the Duty of Fairness 742
a) Ridge v. Baldwin. 742
b) Re Nicholson and Haldimand-Norfolk Reg. Bd. 747
c) Robson v. General Motors. 757
d) Pulsifer v. GTE Sylvania Canada Ltd. 762
6. Discipline 767
a) Hanley v. Pease & Partners. 767
b) McGavin Toastmaster v. Ainscough 768
c) Adams, Grievance Arbitration of Discharge Cases. 774
7. Section 61.5 of the Canada Labour Code. 783
a) Robert v. Bank of Nova Scotia. 783
b) Re Bank of Montreal and Wheeler. 792
c) Fleury v. Speedy. 801
d) W. Ilberg v. Jo-Ann Trucking. 801
e) Some Statistics. 802
8. Frustration 805
a) Employment Standards Act. 805
b) Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 805
c) Ottoman Bank v. Chakarian. 811
d) O'Connell v. Harkema Express. 817
e) Question. 828

9. Employer Going Out of Business 829
a) Nokes v. Doncaster Amalgamated. 829
b) Christie, Employment Law in Canada. 829
c) Town of Yarmouth v. Manser. 838
d) The Employment Standards Act. 841
e) "Preferential Hiring Rights in Business Relocations." 843
10. Layoffs, Suspensions and Lockouts 856
a) Christie, Employment Law. 856
b) TWU v. B.C. Tel. 864
11. Redundancy 870
a) Baker v. Burns Foods 870
b) The Labour Adjustments Benefits Act. 871
c) James O'Connor, The Fiscal Crisis of the State. 873
d) R.J. Adams, "The Unorganized: The Rising Force?" 877
12. Prohibited Dismissals 879
a) Age Discrimination 879
i) OHRC v. Borough of Etobicoke. 879
ii) Tuohy v. Ford Motor. 889
b) Sexual Harassment 890
i) Cox v. Super Great Submarine. 890
ii) Catherine MacKinnon, Sexual Harassment: A Case of Sex Discrimination. 899
13. Third Party Liability for Dismissals 915
a) Nicholls v. Corporation of Township of Richmond et al. 915

VII. HEALTH AND SAFETY: SELECTED PROBLEMS 918

1. Self-Help 918
a) The Right to Know 918
i) Note, "Occupational Health Risks and the Worker's Right to Know." 919
ii) Katherine Swinton, "Enforcement of Occupational Health and Safety Legislation." 926
b) The Right to Refuse Unsafe Work 929
i) Re Steel and United Steelworkers. 929
ii) Katherine Swinton, "Enforcement of Occupational Health and Safety Legislation." 935
iii) Problem. 943

2. Health and Safety and Sex Discrimination 944

a) Linda Howard, "Hazardous Substances in the Workplace." 944

b) Advisory Memorandum 81-1 to the Minister of Labour. 949

c) "Exploring the Biomedical Interface Between OSHA and Title VII." 960

VIII. THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT AND COLLECTIVE BARGAINING 961

A. Introduction 961

B. J.I. Case v. NLRB. 961

C. Re Telegram Publishing v. Zwelling. 966

D. Downey v. Scotia Square Hotel. 975

E. Brunet v. General Motors. 979

F. Problem. 980

IX. THE CONSTITUTIONAL DIVISION OF POWERS 981

A. A.B.C. Trilogy 981

1. Arrow Transfer. 981

2. Westcoast Transmission. 986

3. Canadian Telephone and Supplies. 990

B. A Further Problem 994

1. Railway Clerks and Marathon Realty. 994

2. Problem. 998

C. And Yet Another Problem 990

Evans v. Employment Standards Board. 990

X. PAY 1010

A. The Common Law Obligation to Pay 1010

1. The "Entire Contract" Doctrine. 1010

La Plante v. Kinnon. 1010

2. Sick Employees 1011

a) Dartmouth Ferry v. Marks. 1011

b) Note. 1016

c) Karl Marx, Das Kapital. 1017

d) Della Risley, "An Introduction to the Position of the Sick Employee." 1023